# Error Estimate for the Finite Element Method of the Fractional Perona-Malik 

Shaimaa Kadhum<br>Department of Mathematics, College of Education for Pure Science, Basrah University, Basrah,Iraq.<br>E-mail of the corresponding author: shaim abd@yahoo.com


#### Abstract

In this paper, we present the finite element method for the time-space fractional Perona-Malik equation on a finite domain $\Omega=[0, T] \times[0, X]$. Here the fractional derivative indicates the Caputo derivative for the first-order time and space derivatives of orders $(0<\alpha<1)$ and $(0<\beta<1)$, respectively. The fully discrete scheme is considered by using a finite element method and error estimate in $L^{2}-$ norm is proved of $O\left((\Delta t)^{2-\alpha}+(\Delta x)^{3-\beta}\right)$.


Key words: Perona-Malik equation, finite element methods, fractional time-space derivatives, the left Caputo fractional derivatives

## 1. Introduction

Perona-Malik equation is a technique aiming at reducing the noise in the corrupted images. In the process of imaging and transmission, images are often been polluted by a lot of noise, which not only influences the vision effect heavily, but also takes some difficulties into image analyzing and understanding. Therefore, image smoothing plays an important role in image preprocessing (Feng et al. 2014). The existence and uniqueness are proved of solutions of Perona-Malik equation for $H^{1}$ initial data in (Greer \& Bertozzi 2004) . In (Handlovicova \& Kriva 2005) are derived and proved the error estimates in the $L^{2}$ - norm for the explicit fully discrete numerical finite volume scheme for Perona-Malik equation. Since, we see in (Zhao et al. (2013) there exist two kinds of the fractional derivatives, left(right) Caputo derivative and left(right) Riemann-Liouville derivative for both the time and space derivatives with order $(n-1<\mu<n)$, for any positive integer $n$. In this paper, we paid attention to study of Perona-Malik equation by the concept of the Caputo derivative for the first-order time and space derivatives of orders $(0<\alpha<1)$ and $(0<\beta<1)$, respectively on a finite domain. Therefore we named the left Caputo time-space fractional Perona-Malik equation on a finite domain. The new equation can be analyzed by using the finite element method and we show that the order of the error estimate in $L^{2}-$ norm. This paper is organized as follows. In section 2 we present the fractional Perona-Malik equation with assumptions, properties of this equation and the important lemma of the Gauss function $G_{\sigma}$. The discretization of time-space fractional meshes in a finite domain is shown in section 3. In section 4 we present the weak form of a new equation. The linear finite element approximation scheme of a new equation is shown in section $\mathbf{5}$. In section $\mathbf{6}$ we present the error estimate. The conclusions are shown in section 7.

## 2. The Fractional Perona-Malik Equation

First, we shall present the Perona-Malik equation has the following form as In (Handlovicova \& Kriva 2005):

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{\partial}{\partial t} u(x, t)-\nabla \cdot\left(g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u(x, t)\right|\right) \nabla u(x, t)\right)=0, \quad \text { in } \Omega, \tag{1}
\end{equation*}
$$

$u(t, 0)=u(t, X)=0, \quad$ for $t \in[0, T]$,
$u(0, x)=u^{0}, \quad$ for $x \in(0, X)$,

Where $\Omega=[0, T] \times[0, X]$ is a finite domain. The functions $g$ and $G_{\sigma}$ are a Lipchitz continuous decreasing functions and $G_{\sigma} \in C^{\infty}(\Omega)$ is a smoothing kernel (e.g., Gauss function). In this paper, we paid attention to study of Perona-Malik equation by the concept of the Caputo derivative for the first-order time and space derivatives of orders $(0<\alpha<1)$ and $(0<\beta<1)$, respectively on a finite domain. Therefore we will define the left Caputo time-space fractional Perona-Malik equation on a finite domain with the following new form :

$$
\begin{equation*}
{ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}(x, t)-\nabla \cdot\left(g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u^{n}(x, t)\right|\right){ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}(x, t)\right)=0, \quad \text { in } \Omega, n=1, \ldots, j, \tag{4}
\end{equation*}
$$

$u\left(t_{n}, 0\right)=u\left(t_{n}, X\right)=0, \quad$ for $t_{n} \in[0, T]$,
$u\left(0, x_{n}\right)=u^{0}, \quad$ for $x_{n} \in(0, X)$.

Hence, Gauss function $G_{\sigma} \in C^{\infty}(\Omega)$ can be presented as in (Handlovicova et al. 2002):

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla G_{\sigma} * u^{n}(x, t)=\int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \nabla G_{\sigma}\left(x_{n}-\xi\right) u^{n}(\xi, t) d \xi \quad \text { for } n=1, \ldots, j \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Where ${ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}(x, t)$ and ${ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}(x, t)$ refer to the left Caputo fractional derivatives, For any positive integer $m$ and real numbers $(m-1<\alpha<m)$ and $(m-1<\beta<m)$. We consider the definition of the left Caputo fractional derivatives in general case as in (Zhao et al. (2013),

$$
\begin{aligned}
& { }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} y(x, t)=\frac{1}{\Gamma(m-\alpha)} \int_{0}^{t} \frac{1}{\left(t_{m}-s\right)^{\alpha-m+1}} \frac{d^{m}}{d s^{m}} y(x, s) d s \\
& { }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} y(x, t)=\frac{1}{\Gamma(m-\beta)} \int_{0}^{x} \frac{1}{\left(x_{m}-s\right)^{\beta-m+1}} \frac{d^{m}}{d s^{m}} y(s, t) d s
\end{aligned}
$$

Where $\alpha, \beta>0$ are the orders of Caputo fractional derivatives for the time and the space, respectively. $\Gamma(\cdot)$ is the gamma function. But in this paper we take $m=1$, then the orders of Caputo fractional derivatives for the time and the space it's become $(0<\alpha<1)$ and $(0<\beta<1)$, respectively.

### 2.1 Assumptions

(a) By $\varepsilon$ we denote a generic constant independent of $\Delta t, \Delta x, n, \ldots$ which attains in general different values in different places.
(b) Assume $u\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right) \in L^{\infty}(\Omega) . u_{x}\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right), u_{x x}\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right) \in L^{\infty}\left(L^{2}(\Omega)\right)$ and $u_{t}\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right)$,

$$
u_{t t}\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right) \in L^{\infty}\left(L^{2}(\Omega)\right)
$$

(c) For simplicity we shall write $u\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right)=u^{n}$.
2.1 Basic Properties
(1) Since the functions $g, G_{\sigma}$ are locally Lipschitz-continuous with respect $y, z$ for any constants
$L_{g}, L_{G_{\sigma}}$ respectively such that

$$
|g(y)-g(z)| \leq L_{g}|y-z| \quad \text { and } \quad\left|G_{\sigma}(y)-G_{\sigma}(z)\right| \leq L_{G_{\sigma}}|y-z| .
$$

(2) We shall denote by $(\cdot, \cdot)$ is the scalar product in $L^{2}(\Omega)$ as in (Debnath \& Mikusński 1990 ) i.e.

$$
(u, v)=\int_{\Omega} u v d x, \quad u, v \in L^{2}(\Omega)
$$

The norm $\|u\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}=(u, u)^{1 / 2}, u \in L^{2}(\Omega)$ and the seminorm

$$
|u|_{H_{0}^{1}(\Omega)}=\left(\int_{\Omega}(\nabla u)^{2} d x\right)^{1 / 2} .
$$

Next, in the following lemma we sketch how bounds of the functions $g$ and $G_{\sigma}$ on a finite domain. Lemma
2.1. Since the functions $g, G_{\sigma} \in C^{\infty}(\Omega)$ are satisfy the property (1) and (7) on a finite domain, for $n=1, \ldots, j$ and $r=1, \ldots, n$, gives
(1) $\quad\left|g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u^{n}\right|\right)\right| \leq C L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Delta x_{n}$,
(2) $\quad \sum_{r=1}^{n}\left|g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u_{h}^{r}\right|\right)\right| \leq C L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r}$.

Proof. First, from (5), this observation immediately yields

$$
\begin{equation*}
g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u\left(0, t_{n}\right)\right|\right)=0 \tag{8}
\end{equation*}
$$

By using (8) and the property (1) then
(1)

$$
\begin{aligned}
\left|g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right)\right|\right)-g\left(\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u\left(0, t_{n}\right)\right|\right)\right| & \leq L_{g}| | \nabla G_{\sigma} * u\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right)\left|-\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u\left(0, t_{n}\right)\right|\right| \\
& =L_{g}\left|\nabla G_{\sigma} * u\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right)\right| \\
& \leq L_{g} \int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \nabla G_{\sigma}\left(x_{n}-\xi\right) u\left(\xi, t_{n}\right) d \xi
\end{aligned}
$$

From (7), assumption (a) and property (1), then

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \leq L_{g}\left|u\left(x_{n}, t_{n}\right)\right|_{L^{\infty}(\Omega)}\left|-G_{\sigma}\left(x_{n}-\xi\right)\right|_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \mid \\
& \leq \varepsilon L_{g}\left|-G_{\sigma}\left(x_{n}-x_{n}\right)+G_{\sigma}\left(x_{n}-x_{n-1}\right)\right| \\
& \leq \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left|x_{n}-x_{n-1}-x_{n}+x_{n}\right| \\
& \leq \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Delta x_{r}
\end{aligned}
$$

(2) Similar for the proof of part (1).

## 3. Discretization of Time-Space Fractional Meshes in a Finite Domain

Define the time and space meshes, respectively as follows:
(A) Let $[0, T]=\left[t_{n-1}, t_{n}\right]=\bigcup_{k=1}^{n}\left[t_{k-1}, t_{k}\right], \quad$ for $n=1, \ldots, j$,

$$
\Delta t_{n}=t_{n}-t_{n-1}, \quad n=1, \ldots, j, \quad \Delta t_{k}=t_{k}-t_{k-1}, \quad k=1, \ldots, n \quad \text { and } \quad \max _{1 \leq n \leq j} \Delta t_{n}=\Delta t
$$

(B) Let $[0, X]=\left[x_{n-1}, x_{n}\right]=\bigcup_{r=1}^{n}\left[t_{r-1}, t_{r}\right], \quad$ for $n=1, \ldots, j$,
$\Delta x_{n}=x_{n}-x_{n-1}, \quad n=1, \ldots, j, \quad \Delta x_{r}=x_{r}-x_{r-1}, \quad r=1, \ldots, n$ and $\max _{1 \leq n \leq j} \Delta x_{n}=\Delta x$.

## 4. The Weak Form

we shall introduce a weak form of the linear finite element approximation for the left Caputo time-space fractional Perona-Malik equation on a finite domain. By multiplying the equations (4)-(6) in both sides by an arbitrary $v^{n} \in H_{0}^{1}(\Omega)$ and using the integral by part to find regular exact solution $u^{n} \in H_{0}^{1}(\Omega)$ such that:
$\left({ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}, v^{n}\right)+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Delta x_{n}\left({ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}, \nabla v^{n}\right)=0, \quad$ for $n=1, \ldots, j, \quad \forall v^{n} \in H_{0}^{1}(\Omega)$
$\left(u^{0}, v^{n}\right)=\left(\varphi\left(x_{n}\right), v^{n}\right)$

## 5. The Linear Finite Element Approximation Scheme

We say that $u_{h}^{n} \in V_{h}^{n}, n=1, \ldots, j$ is the piecewise linear finite element approximate solution of the left Caputo time-space fractional Perona-Malik equation on a finite domain (4)-(6) such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u_{h}^{k}-u_{h}^{k-1}\right), v_{h}^{n}\right)+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u_{h}^{r}-u_{h}^{r-1}\right), \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right)=0, \forall v_{h}^{n} \in V_{h}^{n} \tag{11}
\end{equation*}
$$

$\left(u_{h}^{0}, v_{h}^{n}\right)=\left(\varphi\left(x_{n}\right), v_{h}^{n}\right)$,
Where

$$
V_{h}^{n}=\left\{v_{h}^{n} \in C(\Omega):\left.v\right|_{\left[x_{r-1}, x_{r}\right]} \in P_{r}, r=1, \ldots, n\right\}, n=1, \ldots, j,
$$

$P_{r}$ denote the set of piecewise polynomials of degree not exceeding $r$ and

$$
b_{k}^{n}=\frac{1}{\Delta t_{k}} \int_{t_{k-1}}^{t_{k}} \frac{d s}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}}, k=1, \ldots, n \quad \text { and } \quad b_{r}^{n}=\frac{1}{\Delta x_{r}} \int_{x_{r-1}}^{x_{r}} \frac{d s}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}}, r=1, \ldots, n
$$

Now, we present the error estimation of the finite element method.

## 6. The Error Estimate

First, we introduce the two definitions which will be used frequently in the following theorem.
Definition 6.1
(Debnath \& Mikusński 1990 ). In a Hilbert space $V^{n}, n=1, \ldots, j$, then Cauchy-Schwartz inequality is holds

$$
\begin{equation*}
\left\|\left(u^{n}, v^{n}\right)\right\| \leq\left\|u^{n}\right\|\left\|v^{n}\right\| \quad \text { for each } u^{n}, v^{n}, n=1, \ldots, j \tag{13}
\end{equation*}
$$

Definition 6.2 (Quarteroni \& Valli 1997). The two norms $\|\cdot\|$ and $|\cdot|$ on $v^{n}$ are equivalent if there exist two positive constants $\varepsilon_{1}$ and $\varepsilon_{2}$ such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\varepsilon_{1}\left\|v^{n}\right\| \leq\left|v^{n}\right| \leq \varepsilon_{2}\left\|v^{n}\right\| \quad \text { for each } u^{n}, v^{n}, n=1, \ldots, j \tag{14}
\end{equation*}
$$

Lemma 6.1 (Jun \& Tang 2013). Suppose that positives $\delta_{n} n=0,1, \ldots, j$, satisfy

$$
b_{n}^{n} \delta_{n} \leq \sum_{k=2}^{n}\left(b_{k}^{n}-b_{k-1}^{n}\right) \delta_{k-1}+b_{1}^{n} \mu+\omega, \quad n=1, \ldots, j
$$

Where $\omega, \mu$ are positives. Then

$$
\delta_{n} \leq \mu+\omega / b_{1}^{n}, \quad n=1, \ldots, j
$$

Theorem 6.1. Let $u^{n}$ be the exact solution satisfy (9)-(10) and $u_{h}^{n}$ be the piecewise linear finite element approximate satisfy (11)-(12). For $(0<\alpha<1),(0<\beta<1)$ and by using assumption (a), the error
estimation is given by,

$$
\left\|u_{h}^{n}-u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \leq \varepsilon\left((\Delta t)^{2-\alpha}+(\Delta x)^{3-\beta}\right), \quad n=1, \ldots, j
$$

Proof. First, by subtracting Equation (9) from (11). setting $v^{n}=v_{h}^{n} \in V_{h}^{n}$, we get

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u_{h}^{k}-u_{h}^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{c} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}, v_{h}^{n}\right)+ \\
\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u_{h}^{r}-u_{h}^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{c} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}, \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right)=0 . \tag{15}
\end{array}
$$

By adding and subtracting the following terms

$$
\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right), v_{h}^{n}\right) \quad \text { and } \quad \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right), \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right)
$$

We set $e^{n}=u_{h}^{n}-u^{n}$ then the Equation (15) become

$$
\begin{align*}
& \left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(e^{k}-e^{k-1}\right), v_{h}^{n}\right)+\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{c} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}, v_{h}^{n}\right) \\
& \quad+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(e^{r}-e^{r-1}\right), \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right) \\
& \quad+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{c} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}, \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right)=0 . \tag{16}
\end{align*}
$$

Over $k=1, \ldots, n$ for $t_{n} \in[0, T]$, by adding and subtracting the term $\sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k-1}^{n} e^{k-1}$ then we get

$$
\begin{align*}
\sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n} e^{k}-\sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k-1}^{n} e^{k-1}+\sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k-1}^{n} e^{k-1}-\sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n} e^{k-1} & =b_{n}^{n} e^{n}-b_{0}^{n} e^{0}+\sum_{k=2}^{n}\left(b_{k-1}^{n}-b_{k}^{n}\right) e^{k-1} \\
& =b_{n}^{n} e^{n}-b_{1}^{n} e^{0}-\sum_{k=2}^{n}\left(b_{k}^{n}-b_{k-1}^{n}\right) e^{k-1} \tag{17}
\end{align*}
$$

Now, we substitute (17) in (16) and multiplying the both sides by the quantity $\Gamma(1-\alpha)$, then

$$
\begin{aligned}
& b_{n}^{n}\left(e^{n}, v_{h}^{n}\right)+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}}\left(\frac{\Gamma(1-\alpha)}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(e^{r}-e^{r-1}\right), \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right)=b_{1}^{n}\left(e^{0}, v_{h}^{n}\right) \\
& +\left(\sum_{k=2}^{n}\left(b_{k}^{n}-b_{k-1}^{n}\right) e^{k-1}, v_{h}^{n}\right)-\Gamma(1-\alpha)\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{c} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}, v_{h}^{n}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{equation*}
-\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left(\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{c} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}, \nabla v_{h}^{n}\right) . \tag{18}
\end{equation*}
$$

Choosing $v_{h}^{n}=e^{n}$, by using Cauchy-Schwartz inequality (13), from the property (2) and the definition 6.2 , we get

$$
\begin{aligned}
&\left|b_{n}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}^{2}+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \frac{\Gamma(1-\alpha)}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r}\left|b_{r}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{r}-e^{r-1}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \leq \\
&\left|b_{1}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{0}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}+\sum_{k=2}^{n}\left|b_{k}^{n}-b_{k-1}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{k-1}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
&+\Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \quad+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{c} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)},
\end{aligned}
$$

We divide the last equation by the quantity $\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}$, by using assumption (a) and since the term

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \frac{\Gamma(1-\alpha)}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r}\left|b_{r}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{r}-e^{r-1}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}>0, \text { we obtain } \\
& \left|b_{n}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \leq\left|b_{1}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{0}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}+\sum_{k=2}^{n}\left|b_{k}^{n}-b_{k-1}^{n}\right|\left\|e^{k-1}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& +\Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \quad+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}
\end{aligned}
$$

by using lemma 6.1, we have

$$
\begin{align*}
& \left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \leq\left\|e^{0}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}+\frac{1}{\left|b_{1}^{n}\right|}\left\{\Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\right. \\
& \left.\quad+\varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\right\}, \tag{19}
\end{align*}
$$

we can solve the quantity $\left|b_{1}^{n}\right|$, as follows

$$
\left.\left|b_{1}^{n}\right|=\left|\frac{1}{\Delta t} \int_{t_{0}}^{t_{1}} \frac{d s}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}}\right| \leq \frac{1}{(T-0)}\left|\frac{-\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{1-\alpha}}{1-\alpha}\right|_{t_{0}}^{t_{1}}\left|\leq \frac{1}{T}\right| \frac{\left(t_{n}-t_{0}\right)^{1-\alpha}-\left(t_{n}-t_{1}\right)^{1-\alpha}}{1-\alpha} \right\rvert\, \text {, then }
$$

$$
\frac{1}{\left|b_{1}^{n}\right|} \leq T\left|\frac{1-\alpha}{\left(t_{n}-t_{0}\right)^{1-\alpha}-\left(t_{n}-t_{1}\right)^{1-\alpha}}\right| \leq T
$$

Then (19) become

$$
\begin{align*}
\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} & \leq\left\|e^{0}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}+T \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& +T \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} . \tag{20}
\end{align*}
$$

First, we will estimate the term $\left\|e^{0}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}$, by subtracting (10) from (12) and taking $v^{n}=v_{h}^{n}=e^{0}$ we get

$$
\left(e^{0}, e^{0}\right)=0
$$

by using Cauchy-Schwartz inequality (13), gives

$$
\left\|e^{0}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}^{2} \leq 0
$$

Equation (20) become

$$
\begin{align*}
\left\|e^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} & \leq \underbrace{T \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} b_{k}^{n}\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)-{ }_{0}^{C} D_{t}^{\alpha} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}}_{A(1)} \\
& +\underbrace{T \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} b_{r}^{n}\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)-\Delta x_{n}{ }_{0}^{C} D_{x}^{\beta} u^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}}_{A(2)} . \tag{21}
\end{align*}
$$

To estimate the term $|A(1)|$, we use assumption (a), (b), we get

$$
\begin{aligned}
|A(1)| & =T \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \int_{t_{k-1}}^{t_{k}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} \frac{\left(u^{k}-u^{k-1}\right)}{\Delta t_{k}} d s-\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \int_{t_{n-1}}^{t_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} u_{t}^{n} d s\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& =T \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \int_{t_{k-1}}^{t_{k}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} u_{t} d s-\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \int_{t_{n-1}}^{t_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} u_{t}^{n} d s\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq T \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \int_{t_{n-1}}^{t_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} u_{t} d s-\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)_{t_{n-1}}^{t_{n}}} \int_{n}^{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} u_{t}^{n} d s\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \left.\leq T \Delta t_{n} \int_{t_{n-1}}^{t_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} d s \right\rvert\,\left\|\frac{u_{t}-u_{t}^{n}}{\Delta t_{n}}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \left.\leq T \Delta t_{n} \int_{t_{n-1}}^{t_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(t_{n}-s\right)^{\alpha}} d s \right\rvert\,\left\|u_{t t}^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{align*}
& \leq T \Delta t_{n}\left|-\left(t_{n}-t_{n}\right)^{1-\alpha}+\left(t_{n}-t_{n-1}\right)^{1-\alpha}\right|\left\|u_{t t}^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq T \max _{1 \leq n \leq j}\left\{\left(\Delta t_{n}\right)^{2-\alpha}\left\|u_{t t}^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\right\} \\
& \leq \varepsilon(\Delta t)^{2-\alpha}\left\|u_{t t}^{n}\right\|_{L^{\infty}\left(L^{2}(\Omega)\right)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon(\Delta t)^{2-\alpha} \tag{22}
\end{align*}
$$

To estimate the term $|A(2)|$, we use assumption (a), (c), we get

$$
\begin{align*}
|A(2)|= & T \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left\|\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} \int_{x_{r-1}}^{x_{r}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} \frac{\left(u^{r}-u^{r-1}\right)}{\Delta x_{r}} d s-\frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\beta)} \Delta x_{n} \int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} u_{x}^{n} d s\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
= & T \varepsilon L_{g} L_{G_{\sigma}} \frac{\Gamma(1-\alpha)}{\Gamma(1-\beta)}\left\|\sum_{r=1}^{n} \Delta x_{r} \int_{x_{r-1}}^{x_{r}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} u_{x} d s-\Delta x_{n} \int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} u_{x}^{n} d s\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon\left\|\Delta x_{n} \int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} u_{x} d s-\Delta x_{n} \int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} u_{x}^{n} d s\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon\left(\Delta x_{n}\right)^{2}\left|\int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} d s\right|\left\|\frac{u_{x}-u_{x}^{n}}{\Delta x_{n}}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon\left(\Delta x_{n}\right)^{2}\left|\int_{x_{n-1}}^{x_{n}} \frac{1}{\left(x_{n}-s\right)^{\beta}} d s\right|\left\|u_{x x}^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon\left(\Delta x_{n}\right)^{2}\left|-\left(x_{n}-x_{n}\right)^{1-\beta}+\left(x_{n}-x_{n-1}\right)^{1-\beta}\right|\left\|u_{x x}^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon \max _{1 \leq n \leq j}\left\{\left(\Delta x_{n}\right)^{3-\beta}\left\|u_{x x}^{n}\right\|_{L^{2}(\Omega)}\right\} \\
& \leq \varepsilon(\Delta x)^{3-\beta}\left\|u_{x x}^{n}\right\| \|_{L^{\infty}\left(L^{2}(\Omega)\right)} \\
& \leq \varepsilon(\Delta x)^{3-\beta} \tag{23}
\end{align*}
$$

Combining (22) and (23) into (21) then the proof is complete.

## 7. Conclusion

In this paper, we paid attention to study of Perona-Malik equation by the concept of the Caputo derivative for the first-order time and space derivatives of orders $(0<\alpha<1)$ and $(0<\beta<1)$, respectively on a finite domain.

Therefore we defined the left Caputo time-space fractional Perona-Malik equation on a finite domain. The new equation can be solved analytically by using the finite element method and we show that the order of the error
estimate in $L^{2}-$ norm is proved of $O\left((\Delta t)^{2-\alpha}+(\Delta x)^{3-\beta}\right)$.

## References

Debnath L. \& Mikusński P. (1990), "Introduction to Hilbert Spaces with Applications", Department of Mathematics, University of central Florida, Orlanda, Florida,.

Feng Z., Chengwei H. \& Ji Z. (2014), " Modified Perona-Malik Equation and Computer Simulation for Imag Denoising ", The Open Mechanical Engineering Journal 8, Bentham Open, 37-41.
Greer J. \& Bertozzi A. (2004), " $H^{1}$ Solutions of a Class of Fourth Order Nonlinear Equations for Image Processing", Discrete and Continuous Dynamical Systems 10, AIMS, 349-366.
Handlovicova A. \& Kriva Z. (2005), "Perona- Malik Equation-Error Estimates for Explicit Finite Volume Scheme", Mathematical Modelling and Analysis 10, Taylor and Francis, 353-366.
Handlovicova A., Mikula K. \& Sgallari F. (2002), " Variational Numerical Methods for Solving Nonlinear Diffusion Equations Arising in Image Processing", J. Visual Communication and Image Representation 13,Elsevier, 217-237.
Jun J. \& Tang M. (2013), "Moving Finite Element Methods for Time Fractional Partial Differential Equations", Science China Mathematics 56, China press and Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, 1287-1300.
Quarteroni A. \& Valli A. (1997), "Numerical Approximation of Partial Differential Equations", Springer ISBN 3-540-57111-6, Verlag Berlin Heidelberg, New York.

Zhao J., Xiao J. \& Xu Y. (2013), " A Finite Element Method for the Multiterm Time-Space Riesz Fractional Advection-Diffusion Equations in Finite Domain", Abstract and Applied Analysis ID 868035, Hindawi, 1-15.

