

Effect of Outsourcing on the Performance of Selected Quoted Deposit Money Banks in Enugu State

OKECHUKWU, Elizabeth Uzoamaka PhD
Department of Business Administration, Enugu State University of Science and Technology

OKORONKWO, Benard Onwuchekwa Department of Business Administration, Enugu State University of Science and Technology

Abstract

The aim of the study is to assess effect of outsourcing on the performance of selected quoted deposit money banks in Enugu State with regards to influence of loyalty of outsourced staff affect organizational productivity and the effect of job insecurity on organizational growth. Descriptive survey design was adopted in the study among 271 staff of selected money deposit banks in Enugu. Questionnaire instruction was used for data collection. The study hypotheses were tested using linear regression. The result of the study revealed that dual loyalty of outsourced staff negatively affects organizational productivity of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria (t = 16.432; p = .000 < 0.05) and job insecurity significantly affects organizational growth of selected deposit money banks in Enugu State, Nigeria (t = 1.143; p = .007 < 0.05). Based on the findings of the study, it was concluded that outsourcing of human resources as a competitive strategy adopted by the deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria, brought a solution to global financial crises and Enugu state in particular for the survival of the banking industries. The study recommended that Banks should outsource only their activities on the periphery to enable employees' focus on what are their core-competencies and that companies that outsource should continue to monitor the contractor's activities and establish constant communication.

Keywords: Outsourcing, Organizational Performance, Money Deposit Banks, Human Resources

INTRODUCTION

Outsourcing as a concept is not a new phenomenon, as many would believe. Thousands of years ago, our ancestors had understood the need for outsourcing. They realized that it would be impossible for them to be an island—to fulfill all their needs by themselves, but they would have to depend on someone else to serve them. So, we observed that in early societies, every man had a part to play- he could be a farmer, a merchant, a soldier or a barber. He was, in modern parlance, a client, service provider or freelancer (European Commission, 2003). The service provider possessed specialized skills, which enables them to do the work faster, cheaper and more efficiently.

The great industrial revolution between 1750 and 1900 that took place in Europe provided much impetus to the development of outsourcing. This period saw manifold increase in the production of goods and services; the market for them increased and profit were like never before. Many companies began to outsource such activities like accounting, insurance, engineering, legal needs, etc. to specialized firms. These firms were within the country and not offshore. Meanwhile, middle of the 20th century saw many political and economic changes combined with the development of faster means of transportation. Distance began to matters less. Manufacturing of low costing toys and electronic goods, apparels, etc were outsourced to lesser developing countries. The political set up had changed considerably. Many countries in Asia had become free.

Outsourcing was a welcome development as it benefited the developing economies by increasing employment and income levels of the workers. Hamel and Prahala, (1990) assert that a core competence is a bundle of skill and technologies that enables a company to provide a particular benefit to its customers. Gilley, (2000) opines that IT revolution and improvement in computer technology had a great part to play in the next stage of outsourcing history. In the 1990s, many companies began to outsource activities that were essential for them, but these did not include their core activities. Outsourcing activities included data processing, human resources (HR) and accounting. All these enhanced profit for their clients. They clung on to ownership and management of core activities. Currently, because of globalization, the trend is towards forming strategic partnership. Organizations around the world have been considering human resources outsourcing as part of their strategy to cut corporate cost and enable internal employees to focus on the organizational goals (Stroh, 2003). Consequently, the members of the Nigerian banking industries have adopted similar strategy to handle the challenges downsizing, reduction in staff financial benefit, bank verification number(BVN) to cashless policy. There is no agreement whether Human Resources Outsourcing (HRO) as a market trend is appropriate or not. There are pros and cons. The main arguments supporting outsourcing underscore the variety of benefits it can offer companies utilizing it such as cost savings, gaining access to further expertise or freeing up capabilities internally to focus on core competencies (Marchington and Wilkinson, 2008). There are several warnings about the potential drawbacks of outsourcing because the benefits may not be so obvious and there are substantial



financial and human resource consequences; these regard both explicit and implicit costs such as money, time, effort and lost know-how that could counterbalance gains.

Today the question as to if outsourcing really improves firm performance becomes important as firms across nations continue to embark on the practice of outsourcing to save operating costs and remain competitive without knowing the negative effect. Therefore, most of the deposit money banks in Enugu state outsource human resource functions to improve organizational performance without looking beyond their horizon. The initial cost-saving benefits of outsourcing can be misleading, as it often takes some time for the negative effect to be known. When an organization outsources HR, payroll and recruitment services, it involves a risk, if exposing confidential company's information to third party. In case of not choosing a right partner for outsourcing, some of the common problem areas include stretched delivery time frames, dual loyalty problem as well as the creation of job insecurity, substandard quality output and inappropriate categorization of responsibilities.

Although outsourcing, most of the times is cost effective but the hidden cost involved in the signing a contract may pose a serious threat. Also when organization outsource their human resource or part of their human resources, the outsourced staff stand the chance of experiencing simultaneous conflict of accountability to their parent organization and outsourced organization. This role conflict could result into low productivity thus setting in the feeling of job insecurity. At times it is easier to regulate these factors inside an organization rather than with outsourced partner. By the time management realizes that outsourcing is not always the ideal situation they thought it was, bank's reputation may be drag to mud. This could be a reality among the money deposit banks as some deposit money banks find it difficult to meet up with the requirements between their organization and the outsourcing agency. It therefore becomes paramount to examine effect of outsourcing on the performance of selected quoted deposit money banks in Enugu state.

Objectives of the Study

The main purpose of this study is to ascertain the effect of outsourcing on the performance of selected quoted deposit money banks in Enugu state.

- 1. To determine the extent to which dual loyalty of outsourced staff affect organizational productivity of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria.
- 2. To investigate whether job insecurity affect organizational growth of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria.

Research Questions

- 1. To what extent dual loyalty of outsourced staff affect organizational productivity of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria?
- 2. What is the effect of job insecurity on organizational growth of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria?

Research Hypotheses

The following alternate hypotheses will be tested in this study.

- 1. Dual loyalty of outsourced staff significantly affects organizational productivity of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria.
- 2. Job insecurity significantly affects organizational growth of selected deposit money banks in Enugu State, Nigeria.

Review of Related Literature

The concept of Outsourcing

Outsourcing is one of the ways through which firms attempt to address the changing requirements of the marketplace. Outsourcing, therefore, is a process of replacement of in-house provided activities by subcontracting it out to external agents. This strategy allows firms to concentrate their capabilities and resources in their respective core business, giving up those activities that have no competitive advantage added to their corporate value chain. Consequently, management, execution, development of innovations, etc. in outsourced activities became responsibility of an agent external to the firm. Another well-known consequence of this process is the upper bias on the change of the share of services activities in the Gross Domestic product by National Accounts due to the migration of employment from manufacturing industry to Business services (European Commission, 2003).

Outsourcing avails organizations the opportunity to concentrate her core-competencies on definable preeminence business area and provide a unique value for customers (Behara, Gunderson and Capozzoli, 1995) the goal of outsourcing are strategic: improved efficiencies, lower costs, improved flexibility, higher quality, and a greater ability to achieve a competitive advantage. The ultimate strategic goal is to develop core competencies that will strengthen barriers of entry for new firm to survive. By focusing on core competencies and utilizing



qualified vendors to provide process that are not one of the organization's core competencies, such that the organization's risk can be minimized and share with its suppliers.

Armstrong (2009), opines that Outsourcing human resources service which would have previously have been regarded as a business's own responsibility to manage are now routinely being purchased from external suppliers. Managements are facing, Tom (1998) challenges: prove it can't be subcontracted. The formal policy of a major global corporation reads: 'Manufacturing only those items and internally source only those support services that directly contribute to, or help to maintain, our competitive advantage'. The HR function is well positioned to outsource some of its activities to agencies or firms that act as service providers in such fields as training, recruitment, executive search, occupational health and safety services, employee welfare and counseling activities, childcare, payroll administration and legal advisory services. HR function that have been given responsibility for other miscellaneous activities such as catering, car fleet management, facilities management and security(because there is nowhere else to put them) may gladly outsource them to specialist firms.

Ogbo (2014) posits that outsourcing human resources helps an organization to get access to skilled expertise. Human resource outsourcing model as an acceptable management tool for restructuring and refocusing the corporate affairs, goals and objectives, will result in cost saving and overhead reduction, staffing flexibility, development of in-house staff etc. It will result in the shading of non-core corporate activities and right focusing of valuable material and human resources or core activities, thereby repositioning the organization for effectiveness, efficiency, staffing flexibility, operational control and competitiveness (Okorie,2010). Organizations of all sizes (and industries) are outsourcing parts of their human resource business processes to effect improvements in efficiency, service and cost. Service providers are also moving away from the traditional stereotype human resource service delivery model (with increased access to better technology, at reduced cost) to more flexible models and efficient delivery of quality services to the customers.

Outsourcing and Cost efficiency

In the past outsourcing focused on tactical and non-essential activities such as payroll, security (Chung, Jackson and Laseter, 2006) and catering, however the focus is shifting and many businesses are now pursuing outsourcing in strategic operations of businesses such as manufacturing and logistics (Chung, Jackson and Laseter, 2006) that are key to the business performance.

Major drivers of outsourcing in business have been cost efficiency and production reorganization (Franceschini, Galetto, Pignatelli and Varetto, 2003). The globalization effect has shifted the way businesses have been conducted in the past. Today businesses have advanced the art of outsourcing to the extent that even the core business operations which were never thought possible such as design, engineering, research and development, production are now being contracted out (Dehoff and Sehgal, 2007). The benefits derived from reduced costs of operations as a result of outsourcing can be reinvested back into the business. An important source of cost reduction is the outsourcing firm's access to economies of scale and unique expertise, since most contracted firms receive a huge number of clients and can invest in new technologies and innovative practices (Jiang, Frazier and Prater, 2006). Desire to save indirect costs can be a major source of motivation to outsource. Having fewer employees requires less support system and infrastructure which gives rise to nimble and more efficient organizations (Kremic, Tukel and Rom, 2006).

Organizational Performance

Organizations have an important function in our daily lives and therefore, successful organizations represent a key ingredient for developing nations (Gavrea, Lies and Stegerean, 2011). Continuous performance is the focus of any organization because it is only through performance, that organizations are able to grow and progress. Organizational performance is one of the most important variables in the management. Although the concept of organizational performance is very common in the academic literature, its definition is difficult because of its many meanings. For this reason, there is not a generally accepted definition of this concept (Carton, 2004).

Lebans and Esuka (2006) provide a set of definitions to explain the concept of organizational performance:

- (i). Performance is a set of financial and non-financial indicators which offer information on the degree of achievement of objectives and results (Lebans and Esuka, 2006).
- (ii) Performance is dynamic, requiring judgment and interpretation.
- (iii) Performance may be explained by using a casual model that describes how current actions may affect future results.
- (iv) Performance may be understood differently depending on the person involved in the assessment of the organizational performance (e.g. performance can be understood differently from a person within the organization compared to one from outside).
- (v) To define the concept of performance is necessary to know its elements characteristics to each area of responsibility.



In general, the concept of organizational performance is based upon the idea that an organization is the voluntary association of productive assets, including human, physical, and capital resources, for the purpose of achieving a shared purpose (Barney, 2001).

Fundamental to the study of management is an understanding of the goals and objectives of the organization and the processes used to measure their accomplishment (Chandler, 1994). Over the years, there have been many conceptualizations of organizational performance in the strategic management literature. Two critical aspects of organizational performance perspectives in strategic management are the constituencies for whom the organization performs, and the dimensions which should be measured. The following are several different perspectives on these two issues from the strategic management literature. Barney (2000) views organizational performance as the accomplishment of organizational purposes and the degree to which individual motives are satisfied. Barney (2002) argued that the primary measure of an effective and efficient organization is its capacity to survive. Clearly, proposes multi-constituency, one –dimensional perspective of organizational performance.

Chandler (1994) also argues that the ultimate measure of organizational performance is survival. To this end, Chandler (1993) proposed eight different performance dimensions that he felt were essential for the survival and prosperity of a firm. These dimensions included:

- 1 Market standing relative to the market potential both now and in the future.
- 2. Innovation
- 3. Productivity
- 4. Physical and financial resources
- 5. Profitability sufficient to cover the risk premium for being in business.
- 6. Manager performance and development
- 7. Workers performance and attitude etc.

Zahra (2000) proposes that for an organization to accomplish its objectives, it had to utilize its relationships with stakeholders to accomplish organizational goals and stakeholders goals. Stakeholders are not considered organizational constraints. Rather, they are resources to accomplish organizational objectives. This requires satisfying at least the minimal interest of all stakeholders. Freeman's perspective is both multi- constituency and multidimensional.

Chen (2001) proposes that the domain of organizational effectiveness was comprised of three dimensions:

- 1. Financial Performance.
- 2. Operational performance

The effect of job insecurity on organizational growth.

Outsourcing entails dramatic changes in the nature of work, control, and organizational design (Lever, 1997 and Klass, et al., 2001). The outsourcing process usually results in the loss of productivity. Such lower productivity can exasperate an already unacceptable performance level and inspire additional outsourcing (Venkatraman, 2004 and Roberts, 2005). As the outsourcing strategy continues, employees begin to feel insignificant, and level of participation in their respective work groups gradually declines. This might cause an increase level of anxiety and stress (Kennedy, et' al, 2002). Other empirical studies have shown that dissatisfied workers, after the implementation of outsourcing strategy, are more likely to leave the organization than their satisfied colleagues are (Spector, 1997 and Charara, 2004).

The reaction of the employees who participate in the outsourcing program should also be taken into consideration. Survivor syndrome, as defined in HR focus Aug 2009, "refers to a marked decrease in motivation, engagement, and productivity of employees that remain at the company as a result of downsizing and workforce reductions. It entails a series of complex psychological processes and subsequent behavioral responses." Feelings of fear, anger, grief, guilt, insecurity, unfairness, depression, reduced risk taking, and motivation are expressions of survival syndrome. Besides, "survivors" are expected to bring result soon, cover the extra work, and come up with new ideas (Hind, 1999 and Kiplinger, 2009). This additional pressure may lead to high turnover. Employees will be affected from the unilateral "violation of Psychological contract", which is the unwritten agreement between the employer and the employee in which the employer offers job security and stability at the exchange for loyalty and commitment (Sahdev, 2004). Unless this situation is addressed immediately with an effective retention strategy, it will bring additional loss of productivity, confusion, stress, and in all, poor organizational growth (Wood, 2009).

Research Methodology

The research design adopted for the purpose of this study was descriptive survey design. It is because of the sample frame. The study derived its data from two sources namely: primary data and secondary data. The primary data for this study was obtained through the means of questionnaire and interview. Structured questionnaire is the major instrument used to collect data for this study. Unstructured interviews was also used as a means of collaborating with the data obtained from other sources.



There are 22 deposit money banks in Nigeria as a whole and nineteen (19) of money deposit banks branches operate in Enugu state. Out of this 19, the researcher purposely selected 5 deposits banks based on their liquidity, staff strength both permanent and contract. These banks are quoted in the Nigerian Stock Exchange. The population of the study is 917 while a sample size of 271 was obtained using Stat Trek's Sample planning Wizard. Proportionate stratified sampling method was adopted utilizing Bowley's population allocation formula so as to give a proper representation of the designated banks (see appendix).

Research Instrument, Validation and Reliability

The major instruments used in this research for data collection are closed questionnaires and oral interview. The questionnaire was designed in two sections. Section A was for the bio-data of the respondents while section B focused on issues of outsourcing human resources in the Nigerian banking industry. The questionnaire was structured in five Likert scale format. The instrument was face and content validated by giving it to management's experts who studied the instrument thoroughly to ensure that they were in line with objective of this study. A pre tested (50) copies of the test instrument before the actual study. Based on the inter-item correlation of eleven (11) items on the questionnaire the result of the Cronbach Alpha's reliability coefficient of 0.762 was obtained. The hypotheses were tested using inferential statistical technique of linear Regression Analysis and Pearson's Product Correlation Analysis.

Test of Hypotheses

Hypothesis one

Hi: Dual loyalty of outsourced staff negatively affects organizational productivity of selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria.

Table 1: Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate	Durbin-Watson
1	.823ª	.677	.611	.3321	.082

a. Predictors: (Constant), Dual loyalty

b. Dépendent Variable: organizational productivity

Table 2: ANOVAb

Model		Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square
1	Regression	66.403	1	66.403
	Residual	47.263	194	0.243
	Total	113.667	195	

a. Predictors: (Constant), Dual loyalty technology

b. Dépendent Variable: Organizational productivity

Table 3: Coefficients^a

Model		Unstandard	lized Coefficients	Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		В	Std. Error	Beta		
1	(Constant)	.314	.051		11.312	.000
1	Organizational productivity	.271	.012	.823	16.432	000

a. Dependent Variable: Organizational productivity

Summary of Findings

 $\begin{array}{lll} \mathbf{R} & = .823^{\mathrm{a}} \\ \mathbf{R}^{2} & = .677 \\ \mathbf{F} & = 273.3 \\ \mathbf{T} & = 16.432 \\ \mathbf{DW} & = .082 \end{array}$

Interpretation

A linear regression analysis was conducted to ascertain the effect of Dual loyalty of outsourced staff on organizational productivity. The result of the regression indicates that indicates that there is strong positive relationship between dual loyalty of outsourced staff and organizational productivity (R - coefficient = .823).

The R square, the coefficient of determination, shows that only 67.7% of the variation in organizational productivity can be explained by Dual loyalty of outsourced staff with no autocorrelation as Durbbin-Watson



(.082) is less than 2. With the linear regression model, the error of estimate is low, with a value of about .3321. The regression sum of the square 66.403 is greater than the residual sum of the square 47.263 indicating that the variation is not due to chance with F = 273.263. Dual loyalty affect organizational productivity of money deposit banks in Nigeria with the value .823 indicates a significance between dual loyalty and organizational productivity, which is statistically significant (with t = 16.432) with p = .000 < 0.05. Therefore, the null hypothesis should be rejected and the alternative hypothesis accordingly accepted.

Hypothesis Two

Ho: There is no significant relationship between employees focus on core- activities and organizational competitive advantage in selected deposit money banks in Enugu State, Nigeria.

H₁: Job insecurity significantly affects organizational growth of selected deposit money banks in Enugu State, Nigeria.

Table 4: Descriptive Statistics

	Mean	Std. Deviation	N
Job insecurity	1.212	.308	195
Organizational growth	2.129	1.0543	195

Table 5: Model Summary

Model	R	R Square	Adjusted R Square	Std. Error of the Estimate
1	.611	0.373	.061	1.18497

a. Predictors: (Constant), Job insecurity

Table 6: ANOVA^a

Model	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
Regr	ession 40.042	1	40.042	28.52	$.007^{b}$
1 Resid	lual 249.937	178	1.404		
Total	289.979	194			

- a. Dependent Variable: Organizational growth
- b. Predictors: (Constant) Job insecurity

Table 7: Coefficients^a

Model		Unstanda Coeffic		Standardized Coefficients	t	Sig.
		В	Std. Error	Beta		
	(Constant)	3.139	.217		14.451	.000
1	Organizational growth	079	.069	.611	1.143	007

a. Dependent Variable: Organizational growth

Summary of findings

 $\begin{array}{lll} R & = .611 \\ R^2 & = 0.373 \\ F & = 28.52 \\ T & = 13.615 \\ DW & = .253 \end{array}$

Table 4 shows the descriptive statistics of the outsourcing and organizational performance proxy by job insecurity with a mean response of 1.212 and std. deviation of .308 organizational growth with a mean response of 2.129 and std. deviation of 1.0543. By careful observation of standard deviation values, there is not much difference in terms of the standard deviation scores. This implies that there is about the same variability of data points between the dependent and independent variables.

The result of the regression indicates that there is strong positive relationship between Job insecurity of outsourced staff and organizational growth (R - coefficient = .611). The R square, the coefficient of determination, shows that only 37.7% of the variation in organizational growth can be explained by job insecurity of outsourced staff with no autocorrelation as Durbbin-Watson (.187) is less than 2. With the linear regression model, the error of estimate is low, with a value of about .061. The regression sum of the square 40.042 is less than the residual sum of the square 249.937 indicating that the variation is due to chance with F = 28.52. Job insecurity affect organizational growth of money deposit banks in Nigeria with the value .611 indicates a significance between job insecurity and organizational growth, which is statistically significant (with t = 1.143) with p = .007 < 0.05. Therefore, the null hypothesis should be rejected and the alternative hypothesis accordingly accepted.



Conclusion

Based on the summary of the findings, the following conclusions were drawn; the effect of outsourcing human resources on organizational performance in selected deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria has repositioned organization for diversification, economics of scale, specialization, cost cutting, employees' focus, operational control, flexibility of staff, access to superior expertise, efficiency and effectiveness. Banks will achieve cost effectiveness. It also serves as an eye opener to management practitioners to tighten-up on the areas of their intellectual properties and confidential information so that they cannot be tampered with. Job insecurity can also cause psychological problems if not properly managed. Outsourcing of human resources as a competitive strategy adopted by the deposit money banks in Enugu state, Nigeria, brought a solution to global financial crises and Enugu state in particular for the survival of the banking industries.

Recommendations

- 1. Banks should outsource only their activities on the periphery to enable employees' focus on what are their core-competencies.
- 2. Companies that outsource should continue to monitor the contractor's activities and establish constant communication.

References

Armstrong (1999). *Hand book of human resources management practice*. United Kingdom, 120 Pentoville Road, London NI 9JN.

European Commission (2003). The competitiveness of business related services and their contribution to performance of European enterprise, 2003(747).

Ogbo, Ann I. (2014). Understanding Business. Enugu, De-Verge Agencies LTD.

Okorie N.E. (2010a). Growing Corporate Excellence and Effectiveness Using Business process.

Outsourcing Model: Issues, Dimensions, Challenges and prospects. In press



Table 3.1:The Population distribution of selected banks in Enugu state, Nigeria

S/N	UBA Branches	Staff	Eco bank	Staff	. First Bank	Staff	Access bank	Staff	Union bank	Staff
	20. Okpara Av.	30	2 nd Okpara Av. En. North	30	47a old Onitsh Rd 9 th Mile	20	No. 67 Ogui Rd	30	Union bank Staff	20
	143 Agbani Rd	35	2B Okpara Av.	35	2 nd Okpara Av. En. North	19	. 67 Ogui Rd by Nnamdi Aziwe Stadiu	27	9 th Mile Ngwo	21
	University of Nigeria, Nsukka.	27	21 Amaoba Street	35	Eha-aloma club house	25	University of Nigeria Enugu Campus	20	Anamco site Emene	20
	20 Onitsha Rd Nnewi.	29			48 Nsukka Rd along Amufu	27			Ogbete main market	30
	2 pocket Estate Ind. Layout.	32			Emene Estate 1 bank Rd	26			3garden Av.222 Enugu	19
	Aguoba Owa Eziagu	37			77 Nike Rd Abakpa	29				
	Ubaji-Igboeze	25			127 Agbani Rd	30				
	Independence L/out, Upper presidential	30			11 Okpara Av. Beside Enugu North	28				
					Ehaalumona club house.	23				
					77Nike Rd. Abakpa.	20				
					Ogbete main-market	35				
					95 Ogui Rd Enugu.	30				
					79 presidential Rd. Enugu.	26				
					26 Zik Av. Uwani Enugu.	21				
					Ikem, c/o postal Agency via Nsukka.					
	Total	245		105		383		77		110

Source: FBN, Access bank, Union bank, Eco bank, UBA, Human Resource Department

$$n = e^2 + \frac{Z^2 Pq + e^2}{(Z^2 Pq/N)}$$
 (Trek, 2004; Bartlett, Kotrlik and Higgins, 2001)

Where;

n = Sample

Z = Standard error of the mean (usually 95%, corresponding to 1.96 in the

Z – Distribution table)

P = Proportion of the population likely to be included in the sample (50% or 0.5 is assumed)

e = Level of significance (assumed to be 5% or 0.05)

N = Population size (established at 917).

In order to get quantity of the questionnaires to be distributed in each of the five (5) selected banks, the sample size has to be broken down using. It is thus:

Where

NL = no of the items in each category

N = sample size

nh = no of units allocated to each group.

w = population size.

Table 3.1: Questionnaire administered accounting to number of Bank's staff

Banks	Population	No of questionnaire to be	Percentage of questionnaire (%)
		administered	distributed
UBA Bank	245	72	23
ECO Bank	102	30	10
FIRST Bank	383	113	44
ACCESS Bank	77	23	10
UNION Bank	110	33	13
Total	917	271	100

Source: Field Survey, 2015.



Appendix Two

Sample Size determination

$$n = e^2 + \frac{Z^2 Pq + e^2}{(Z^2 Pq/N)}$$

(Trek, 2004; Bartlett, Kotrlik and Higgins, 2001)

Where;

n = Sample

Z = Standard error of the mean (usually 95%, corresponding to 1.96 in the

Z – distribution table)

P = Proportion of the population likely to be included in the sample (50%)

or 0.5 is assumed)

e = Level of significance (assumed to be 5% or 0.05)

N = Population size (established at 917).

Substituting in the formula, we obtain:

$$n = \frac{(1.96^2 \times 0.5) + 0.05^2}{0.05^2 + (1.96^2 \times 0.5 \times 0.5/917)}$$

$$= \underbrace{(3.8416 \times 0.5 \times 0.5) + 0.0025}_{0.0025 + (3.8416 + 0.5 + 0.5/917)}$$

$$= \frac{0.9604 + 0.0025}{0.0025 + (0.9604/917)}$$

$$= \frac{0.9629}{0.0025 + 0.00104732824}$$

$$= \frac{0.9629}{0.00354732824}$$

= 271