Role of Work Family Conflict on Organizational Commitment and Organizational Effectiveness

Prof. DR. Shoukat Malik
Director, Alfallah Institute of Banking and Finance, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan

Prof. Dr. Abdul Ghafoor Awan
Dean, Faculty of Management and Social Sciences, Institute of Southern Punjab-Pakistan
ghafoor70@yahoo.com

Qurat-ul-Ain
MS Scholar, Business Administration, Department of Business Administration, Institute of Southern Punjab-Pakistan
qurat_ull_ain@yahoo.com.

Abstract
This research study explores the relationship of work family conflicts with organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. Mainly the study was conducted in service sector of two cities of Pakistan including D. G. Khan and Multan. Target sample included University Teachers and personnel of banking institutions within these two cities. There were one predictor variable, work family conflict and two criterion variables, organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. For the purpose of data collection a structured questionnaire was used and seven point Likert scale was applied to measure the response of 306 respondents. The questionnaire was consisting of a total of 46 questions. Total 400 questionnaires were distributed among different respondents of these two cities out of which 306 were returned from respondents those were useable for data analysis. So response rate for this study was 77 percent. SPSS v.20 was incorporated for data analysis. Different statistical techniques were used like factor loading (As a data reduction technique), Reliability analysis (To check the consistency among the different questions of a variable), Descriptive statistics (To check the central tendency), Correlation analysis (To check the relationship among variables) and regression analysis including model summary and ANOVA (To check the cause and effect relationship among variables). Results found that work family conflict is negatively related with organizational effectiveness and same was found true for organizational commitment so work family conflict is a significant predictor for organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. It is suggested that managers of organizations should consider the factors of work family conflicts in policy making and should take reasonable proper steps to improve organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness and to reduce work family conflicts.

Keywords: work family conflict, organizational commitment, organizational effectiveness

INTRODUCTION
Every organization and business wants to be successful and have desire to get constant progress. The current era is highly competitive and organizations regardless of size, technology and market focus are facing employee retention challenges and among them the most dominant challenge that is faced by the organizations is work family conflict. Work family conflict is considered to be an important issue of today business world (Grandey et al. 2005). The issues of work family conflict are basically related with time, pay and incentives. Now defining the word organizational commitment means the honesty and sincerity with the work, Mowday. et al. (1982) defined commitment as the relative strength of an individual’s identification and involvement with the organization of work and the word organizational effectiveness means the quality of input that has been obligated by the individual towards his organization. Organizational effectiveness plays an important role in accelerating organizational development.

Aydin, B., & Ceylan, A. (2009). It is the net satisfaction of all constituents in the process of gathering and transforming inputs into output in an efficient manner (Restubog et al. 2008). If there is low input performed by an individual in an organization the output will also be low that is effectiveness (Etzioni, A. 1961). Now in this research paper it is elaborated that because of work family conflict (WFC) the organizational commitments are deeply affected and thus the organizational effectiveness.

Objective of the Study
The broad objective of this research is to examine the effects of work family conflicts and its impact on organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. The specific objectives include:

To investigate the impact of work family conflicts on organizational commitment.
To investigate the impact of work family conflicts on organizational effectiveness.
Main Research Questions
In the light of above discussion the following research questions can be crafted,

What is the impact of work family conflict on organizational commitment?
What is the impact of work family conflict on organizational effectiveness?

LITERATURE REVIEW
There are different research papers that discuss and define the work family conflict in different ways. We summarize them in the followings:-

WORK FAMILY CONFLICT
Work family conflict can be defined as a form of conflict in which, role pressure associated with membership in one organization is in conflict with pressure stemming from membership in other group. Work family conflict can also defined as a form in which work making it more difficult to accomplish task associated with one’s family. (Greenhaus, J.H., & Beutell, N.J. 1985).

Greenhaus, J.H., & Beutell, N.J. (1985) concluded that work-family conflict occurs when demands from one role affects one’s ability to meet the demand associated with another role in another domain. Later in 2001 he also stated that work family conflict is defined as a consequence of inconsistent demands between the role at work and in the family. In other words work family conflict exists when the expectations related to the certain role do not meet the requirements of the other role. Thus these conflicts arise when one gives more time to work and less time to family. If one person work day and night in an office and comes late at home and due to more pressure of work unable to pay more attention to his family then it will create the conflict (Maslach et al. 1981). Secondly the work family conflict also arises when our pay and incentives have low involvement on our growth and time has high involvement (Frone et al. 1997). Work family conflict is indeed an issue that can affect almost all aspects of people's lives. Human resource professionals have to spend a lot of time to their organization as their work is stimulating and challenging. Implications suggest need to move from control oriented to commitment oriented work practices and to align configurationally HR strategies to these high commitment work practices (Baral et al. 2010).

TIME BASED WORK CONFLICT
Researchers have measured work–family conflict in many ways, majority of researchers have considered time-based conflict significantly, (Netemeyer, Boles & McMurrian, 1996; Stephens & Sommer, 1993). Consistent with Greenhaus and Beutell’s (1985) definition, three forms of work–family conflict have been identified in the research paper: (a) time-based conflict, (b) Strain-based conflict and (c) behavior-based conflict. But Time-based conflict is more heavily highlighted by these researchers.

PAY AND INCENTIVES
HR incentive typically designed to induce motivation and attachment to the organization include high relative pay and benefits, opportunities for training and career development, and implicit or explicit employment security (Appelbaum et al., 2000; Arthur, 1994). Few studies, however, have examined the link between these HR incentive practices and work-family outcomes. In theory these practices are beneficial to employees and their families because they provide the kind of employment stability and income growth that family need (Raabe, 1990). If we look at our topic collectively then we came to know that the issues related to W-F conflict are the major reason of conflict in the organization, and thus put their negative impact on the organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness.

ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT
The organizational commitment is that in which the individuals are very much committed with their work. Organizational commitment was defined by Allen & Meyer (1990) as, “psychological state that binds the individual to the organization (i.e. makes turnover less likely).” Relating to commitment with turnover; Mowday, R. T. et al. (1979) conducted a comprehensive study to develop a model to find out antecedents and outcomes of organizational commitment. Since 1990 the concept of organizational commitment is major focus of administrative research. It has been classified into following three categories by the researchers (Meyer, J. P., & Allen, N. J. 1991).

(1) Affective
(2) Continuance
(3) Normative commitment

Affective commitment is one when an employee becomes emotionally attach to an organization, he strongly identifies the goals and objectives of the organization and he desires to remain the part of organization throughout his career. Likewise, continuance commitment is that when an employee feels that it would be costly
to leave the organization, he builds a desire to continue working for the organization. Similarly, the normative commitment is such when an employee feels that it is obligatory i.e. ‘due to norms or pressures from others’, for him to continue working for the particular organization (Meyer & Allen, 1991; Greenberg, J. 2006).

ORGANIZATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS
Organizational effectiveness is defined as how effective an organization is in achieving the outcomes the organization is intended to produce. It is very difficult to measure the effectiveness of organization or we can say that it is impossible to measure the effectiveness of organization, so instead of measuring the effectiveness the organization defines proxy measures which will be used to represent the effectiveness (Riordan et al. 2005).

Organizational effectiveness means the quantity of input that has been obligated by the work. The motivational factor is also involved in the organizational effectiveness. High employee’s motivation leads to high organizational effectiveness. So employee’s performance and employee’s motivation factors affect the organizational effectiveness. (Malik, M. E. et al. 2010). As the performance of the employees increases if they have high effectiveness level, and we divide this performance satisfaction in two ways (Lindsey, K. 2002),
1 Work satisfaction
2 Family satisfaction

CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK
Based on the above mentioned literature review, the following theoretical model framework has been developed. FIGURE 1:-

It is important to note that previous research studies explore the relationship between organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness and how w-f conflict effect life of individuals working in different organizations. In above model there are two important factors to be observed.
First, How work family conflict puts its impact on organizational commitment?
Second, How work family conflict puts its impact on organizational effectiveness?
Model explained that w-f conflict is a combination of three things
1) Pay
2) Incentives
3) Time

ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT
• CONTINUANCE
• NORMATIVE
• AFFECTIVE

ORGANIZATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS
1. FAMILY SATISFACTION
2. WORK SATISFACTION

WORK FAMILY CONFLICT FACTORS
Time Pay incentives

Furthermore W-F conflict has a direct effect on organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. According to this conceptual model organizational commitment is defined on three measures by Meyer, J. P., & Allen, N. J. (1991).
1) Continuance commitment
2) Normative commitment
3) Affective commitment
And on the other hand organizational effectiveness is measured on one variable as performance satisfaction as
determine by Brayfield, A. H. et al. (1951), Performance satisfaction is further subdivided into two categories 1). Family satisfaction 2). Work Satisfaction.

**FORMULATION OF HYPOTHESIS**

The study focuses on the following literature to seek support for hypothesis derivation.

**W-F CONFLICT AND ITS RELATIONSHIP WITH ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT**

Conflict occurs in all walks of life. Stress, caused by bearing load of many responsibilities can result in Poorness of performance in any one (or more) of them, because the individual pays greater attention to those that interest him or her. This conflict of interest is commonly observed in full-time employees of any organization who maintain a family. Thus, Work-Family Conflict (WFC) causes an imbalance between work and family life, and these conflicts interfere with affecting outcomes in organization and thus due to these conflicts organizational commitments are affected. (Akintayo, D. I. 2010). Organizational commitment is of three types, i.e. affective commitment, normative commitment, and continuous commitment (Meyer, J. P., & Allen, N. J. 1991). He found that committed employees are more likely to remain with the organization and strive towards the organization’s mission, goals, and objectives than others. My study focus on the relationship of w-f conflict with the organizational commitment.

Therefore the proposed hypothesis based on literature is:

H1: There is negative relationship between w-f conflict and organizational commitment.
H1a: There is negative relationship between w-f conflicts and affective commitment.
H1b: There is negative relationship between w-f conflicts and continuance commitment.
H1c: There is negative relationship between w-f conflicts and normative commitment.

**W-F CONFLICT AND ITS IMPACT ON ORGANIZATIONAL EFFECTIVENESS**

Organizational effectiveness is a measure of how well a business or foundation meets its organizational goals. Measuring organizational effectiveness can be an inexact science, since each individual entity will have a different list of criteria and priorities to weight and consider through self-assessment (Steers, R. M., et al. 2004). So this research focus on the content that the work family conflict puts its impact on the effectiveness of organization. If the employees are committed and satisfied with their work and organization then it result in the positive efficiency of the organization and thus the effectiveness of organization also increases and on the other hand the work family conflict will put negative impact on the effectiveness of organization and thus the efficiency of the organization decreases. Therefore the proposed hypothesis based on the literature is:

H2: There is negative relationship between work family conflict and organizational effectiveness.
H2a: There is negative relationship between work family conflict and family satisfaction.
H2b: There is negative relationship between work family conflict and work satisfaction.

**RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

Adopted questionnaire is used as a research instrument. The adopted questionnaire describes the management of work duties and responsibilities of a family. The instrument used 7 point Likert scale from 1 to 7. The questionnaire gives importance to all those factors relating to organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. A sum total of 400 questionnaires were distributed among the required respondents but only 306 were returned in full and are used for our analysis, so the sample size of this study is 306 and is selected through convenient sampling method.

We have used convenient sampling to reach the target audience conveniently. Its non-probability sampling that provides researcher option to choose target audience according to his/her choice.

**DATA COLLECTION TECHNIQUE**

The author used primary data in this study and this data was collected through a structured questionnaire containing 46 questions. The questionnaires were mailed to 400 members of target group out of which 306 were received back. The data was inserted into SPSS v.20 for making it useful for analysis. Mainly, there were no missing values in the questionnaire but at the time of inserting values in the SPSS, some values remained blank. To tackle those missing values, missing values was replaced with 4 (which are having neutral response). It will not create an effect on positive or negative side of hypothesis.

**SAMPLE SIZE**

Total 306 persons working in the Universities and banking institutions in Multan and D.G.Khan Cities were selected as a sample of this study.

**ESTIMATION TECHNIQUE**

We used different techniques for analysis of data but the major techniques to assess the goodness of fit and
stability of different models regression analysis method has been used in this study.

APPLICATION OF TESTS

Different tests were performed in order to get the results of the study. Exploratory factor analysis for theory matching to results, Descriptive statistics for getting central tendency and regression analysis to know the cause and effect relationship between variables.

RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY

Gerbing, D. W. et al. (1988) described different basic guidelines for the reliability and validity of measurement scale used in the study. A step-by-step approach is used for analysis. First of all, it’s necessary to perform factor analysis as data reduction techniques in order to diminish the questions in the measurement tool. For the purpose of examining the common variance, all the items were included in the analysis. KMO and Bartlett test was incorporated for checking the appropriateness of scale used in this study and prove about adequacy of sample. Table 4.91 shows the results for KMO and Bartlett test. The value of KMO is 0.755 which shows more than the appropriateness according to the standard criteria of KMO value 0.50 so KMO value is above average. Bartlett Test is also showing the significant value 0.000 which makes this analysis perfect for performing factor analysis. Secondly according to the recommendation of Hair, J. F. et al. (2007). All the values were above the set criteria of cut-off value. The reliability of this scale was checked with the help of Cronbach’s alpha and set criteria of 0.70. All the variables were having a good reliability of the scale used in this context.

KMO and Bartlett’s test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Measure of Sampling Adequacy</th>
<th>0.755</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Approx. Chi Square</td>
<td>4933.038</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bartlett’s Test of Sphericity</td>
<td>df = 465</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sig. = 0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Descriptive statistics & Pearson Correlation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variables</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>S.D</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WFC</td>
<td>5.5987</td>
<td>.52729</td>
<td>- .188**,</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OC</td>
<td>5.5122</td>
<td>.30767</td>
<td>.218**,</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OE</td>
<td>5.3583</td>
<td>.35090</td>
<td>-.209**,</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**. Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed)

This study used the Pearson correlation in order to check the correlation among different variables. Table shows the confirmation of correlation among different variables in this study. The correlation between organizational commitment and work family relation is -.188 that confirms a negative relation between these two variables. Similarly the correlation results between organizational effectiveness and work family relation is -.209 that is an indication of negative relation between these two variables. Results of correlation show that correlation between organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness is .218 so it is clear that organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness are positively correlated with each other. The correlations among all variables used in this study is not so high which is making this model fit and also pushes away from the fear of multicollinearity.

REGRESSION ANALYSIS:-

1. RELATIONSHIP OF WORK FAMILY CONFLICT AND ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT:-

Results describes that there is highly significant negative relation between work family conflict and organizational commitment. It means null hypothesis of work family relation and organizational commitment is rejected and alternative hypothesis H1 is accepted so it is clear that there is negative relation between work family conflict and organizational commitment.
2. RELATIONSHIP OF WORK FAMILY CONFLICT AND AFFECTIVE COMMITMENT:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Structural Path</th>
<th>Standardized Regression Weights</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Significant/In-significant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1a</td>
<td>WFC ➔ ACMT</td>
<td>-.138</td>
<td>.0450</td>
<td>-2.430</td>
<td>.016**</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results illustrates that there is negative significant relationship between work family conflicts and affective organizational commitment. It means null hypothesis of work family conflicts and affective organizational commitment is rejected and alternative hypothesis H1a is accepted.

3. RELATIONSHIP OF WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND ORGANIZATIONAL CONTINUANCE COMMITMENT:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Structural Path</th>
<th>Standardized Regression Weights</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Significant/In-significant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1b</td>
<td>WFC ➔ CCMT</td>
<td>-.148</td>
<td>.046</td>
<td>-2.612</td>
<td>.064**</td>
<td>In-Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results illustrate that there is highly insignificant negative relationship of work family conflicts and continuance commitment. It means null hypothesis of H1b is accepted as P-value is insignificant. It also means that these two variables are though related with each other negatively but this amount of negativity is not significant to accept alternate H1b.

4. RELATIONSHIP OF WORK FAMILY CONFLICT AND NORMATIVE COMMITMENT:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Structural Path</th>
<th>Standardized Regression Weights</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Significant/In-significant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1c</td>
<td>WFC ➔ NCMT</td>
<td>-.157</td>
<td>.0485</td>
<td>-2.776</td>
<td>.0060**</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results illustrate that there is highly significant negative relationship of work family conflicts and normative organizational commitment. Its means that higher the level of work family conflicts lower will be normative organizational commitment. It means null hypothesis of work family conflict of H1c is accepted.

5. RELATIONSHIP OF WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND FAMILY SATISFACTION:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Structural Path</th>
<th>Standardized Regression Weights</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Significant/In-significant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H2a</td>
<td>WFC ➔ FS</td>
<td>-.013</td>
<td>.0450</td>
<td>-2.31</td>
<td>.0000**</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results illustrates that there is highly significant negative relationship of work family conflicts and family satisfaction. It means null hypothesis of effect of work family conflicts and family satisfaction is rejected and alternative hypothesis H2a is accepted.

6. RELATIONSHIP OF WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND WORK SATISFACTION:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Structural Path</th>
<th>Standardized Regression Weights</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Significant/In-significant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H2b</td>
<td>WFC ➔ WS</td>
<td>-.0105</td>
<td>.0366</td>
<td>-3.11</td>
<td>.0060**</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results illustrate that there is significant negative relationship of work family conflicts and work satisfaction. It indicates that negative beta value implies that relation between work family conflicts and work satisfaction is negative. Significant T-value indicates that relative importance of this negativity and same thing can be observed from significant P-value. So null hypothesis of work family conflicts and work satisfaction is rejected and alternate hypothesis is accepted so H2b is accepted statistically.
OVERALL ANALYSIS OF ALL HYPOTHESES:-

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis</th>
<th>Structural Path</th>
<th>Standardized Regression Weights</th>
<th>Standard Error</th>
<th>T-Value</th>
<th>P-Value</th>
<th>Significant/ In-significant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1 WFC</td>
<td>OC</td>
<td>-.209</td>
<td>.078</td>
<td>-3.729</td>
<td>.000**</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H2 WFC</td>
<td>OE</td>
<td>-.047</td>
<td>.038</td>
<td>-8.14</td>
<td>.000**</td>
<td>Significant</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

According to this table, for Hypothesis 1, work family conflicts is negatively related with organizational commitment and this relation is significant as P-value is significant and confirming that hypothesis H1 is found to be true and accepted so it is proved statistically that there is negative relation of work family conflict with organizational commitment. Similarly the results for hypothesis 2 also confirming that a significant negative relation is observed between work family conflict and organizational effectiveness so again the hypothesis H2 is found to be true and accepted. So both hypothesis are found to be true and accepted.

FINDING AND RESULTS
WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT
Work family conflicts effect negatively on organizational commitment. Work family conflict is considered to be an important issue of today business world. The issues of work family conflicts are basically related with time, pay and incentives. Time based conflict occurs when the amount of time devoted to work interferes with family responsibilities. High and low pay also puts its impact on work family conflict, employees who are more satisfied with their pay report lower level of work family conflict, as indicated in a study by a university of Illinois labor and employment relation. So if the pay of the employees is high and satisfactory then they result in a lower level of work family conflict. The incentives are also directly related with the work family conflict. Respondents of the study were of the opinion that all three dimensions of work family conflicts (Time, Pay, incentives) play a significant role for organizational commitment.

WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND AFFECTIVE ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT
Work family conflicts have negative impact on effective organizational commitment as proved statistically in this study. Affective commitment is most important factor for any organization because when employees of an organization belong to affective commitment then there level of loyalty and sincerity with organization is very high.

WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND CONTINUANCE ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT
Our study does not confirm a significant negative relation with this component of organizational commitment as empirical results do not support that work family conflicts create negative continuance commitment. Results showed that although there is negative relation between works family conflicts and continuance commitment (as beta value is negative) but this relation is not significant in other words we can say that this negative relation between these two variables is not so critical that it belongs to significant level.

WORK FAMILY CONFLICTS AND NORMATIVE ORGANIZATIONAL COMMITMENT
Relation of work family conflicts with normative organizational commitment is also negative and significant. It means that higher the level of work family conflicts, lower will be normative organizational commitment.

CONCLUSIONS
The findings of this study confirm that work family conflicts have negative relations with organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness. It is also confirmed that work family conflicts are very significant predictors for managers to understand why the level of commitment of employees is not sufficient. Work family conflicts for this study were caused due to three factors, Pay, incentives and time. It is observed that these three factors are equally important and management of organization should give due consideration to cater these three factors in order to avoid work family conflicts.

Organizational commitment of workers can be increased by lowering down the level of work family conflicts and same is true in the matter of organizational effectiveness. This research study gives better insights for understanding work family conflicts as a specific predictor for organizational commitment and organizational effectiveness.

REFERENCES
The IISTE is a pioneer in the Open-Access hosting service and academic event management. The aim of the firm is Accelerating Global Knowledge Sharing.

More information about the firm can be found on the homepage: http://www.iiste.org

CALL FOR JOURNAL PAPERS

There are more than 30 peer-reviewed academic journals hosted under the hosting platform. Prospective authors of journals can find the submission instruction on the following page: http://www.iiste.org/journals/ All the journals articles are available online to the readers all over the world without financial, legal, or technical barriers other than those inseparable from gaining access to the internet itself. Paper version of the journals is also available upon request of readers and authors.

MORE RESOURCES

Book publication information: http://www.iiste.org/book/

Academic conference: http://www.iiste.org/conference/upcoming-conferences-call-for-paper/

IISTE Knowledge Sharing Partners

EBSCO, Index Copernicus, Ulrich's Periodicals Directory, JournalTOCS, PKP Open Archives Harvester, Bielefeld Academic Search Engine, Elektronische Zeitschriftenbibliothek EZB, Open J-Gate, OCLC WorldCat, Universe Digtial Library, NewJour, Google Scholar