Comparative Study of Local Government with Reference to Pakistan and Turkey Relationship

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Ahmed Qadri
University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Suwaibah Qadri
Research Scholar, University of Karachi, Karachi, Pakistan

Dr. Lubna Ahsan
Assistant Professor, Iqra University, Karachi, Pakistan

Abstract
This article is about long lasting Pakistan and Turkey relationship. The bond between Pakistan and Turkey is considered to be long before the independence of the state and the history reveals that Muslims of subcontinent always had a soft corner in their hearts filled with compassions regarding Sultan of Turkey. This sentiment of belonging prevailed in the Muslims even after the downfall of Sultan and emergence as an independent state.

The article for the sake of understanding has been classified as a timeline that depicts the details of the relationship between the two nations under the governance of different political parties and leaders. This article includes the major and noteworthy events, ceremonies and treaties specially designed to cement the ties of Pakistan and Turkey.

Since the independence Turkey has made special efforts to maintain a positive atmosphere between the two states. This resulted in Baghdad Pact (which later changed to Central Treaty Organization (CENTO) and the Regional Co-operation for Development (RCD) (which later changed its name into the Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO). The two states have initially worked together in the defense domain and signed different treaties that would promote peace and security not only in their respective regions but also to support world peace. These treaties were also aimed to show good will with the western countries and to gain their trust in war against terrorism. Turkey has also played as a negotiator and facilitator when Pakistan was at cold war with Afghanistan and India. Both Pakistan and Turkey has always support each other in the issues like Kashmir dispute and Cyprus Issue.

During the mid-1980s, the communication between the two nations got weakened when RCD lost its enthusiasm. There came a phase when Turkey and Pakistan bond got distressed primarily because of the support of Pakistani government to Taliban. The cold war remained intact when the mutually signed treaties lost its zest and failed to perform up to the expectations, until the Musharraf era.

Musharraf due to his keen interest and intense appreciation in the leadership of modern turkey made special efforts to revitalize the broken links between Pakistan and Turkey. It is right to be said that he became very successful in rejuvenating the connection. Due to his supreme respect for Mustafa Kemal Ataturk, the founder of modern Turkey, President Musharraf started the consensual high-level official visits. President Musharraf also honored to make the first ever address to the Turkish parliament as a Pakistani leader.

Currently in 2015, Pakistan and Turkey with the much stronger ties than ever before, is planning for economic advancement by availing the trade opportunities along with the redefined defense strategies.

Introduction
Since the independence of our state in 1947, Pakistan has generally made great efforts to maintain friendly and pleasant relations with Turkey, owing to mainly a common culture and geopolitical concerns. The relation between Pakistan and Turkey, since inception of Pakistan, is deeply rooted. In addition to a major support of corresponding cultural and religious heritage, both countries share a mutual vision on many regional and international affairs. For over half century, Turkey and Pakistan remained close friends. Their strong bonding and mutual concerns over different areas cemented the relationship which reflected the same spirit of brotherhood that had prevailed during centuries; that were the old ties between Indian Muslims and the Ottoman Empire/Republic of Turkey until 1947. Ideologically, the two states were poles apart – Turkey is a secular state while Pakistan’s ideology was based on basic principles of Islam. But despite of the massive difference in ideology, both countries reflections and thoughts on different and respective external issues never hampered the course of friendly ties. Turkey has acknowledged the support offered by the Pakistani nation and the aid provided by the Pakistani army in waging a war on terror, on many occasions through international forums. Turkey also helped Pakistan in the hour of need and came all out for Pakistan’s assistance when the country was at damage due to natural distress. Furthermore, Turkey has been frequently mentioned as a ‘role model’ by Pakistani authorities as Pakistan tries to cope with the hassles of democratization, demands of economic modernization, and anxieties of political transformation. Briefly, it could
be said that Pakistan and Turkey, provided with the long history, have had good relations that have been strengthened and refreshed with time through growing economic cooperation between the two governments in sectors such as energy, transport, communications, infrastructure, textiles, automobiles, agriculture, industry, food processing, dairy development, information technology, oil and gas, and lastly trade agreements. (News Desk, 2013)

**Brief History of Pak-Turkey Relationship:**

The development of relationship and the intentions to build a positive bond between Pakistan and Turkey can be traced back to the time of British India, before the freedom of Pakistan but the Pakistan Movement was in progress. Until 1924, the symbol of universal Islamic unity for the Indian Muslims was the Sultan of Turkey in his capacity as the Khalifa of Islam, and the fate of Turkey; therefore, Turkey always had the emotional support of Muslims in India. During the Russo-Turkish war of 1877, religious services were held in the mosques in Calcutta and large donations were collected for the Turkish injured. All consequent events in Turkey caused similar compassion evoked in British India Muslims. Some famous and noteworthy wars in these were the wars against Greece that took place in 1897, against Italy occurred in 1911, and the Balkan League, befallen in 1912. During the Balkan War, the Muslims of subcontinent sent medical assistance to Turkey. (Ali, 1988)

It has been said that a large amount of money was collected more enthusiastically for the Turkish cause than for any other cause designed for the betterment of the Indian Muslims. After the First World War, in which Turkey had been on the down side, the Muslims of subcontinent tried their utmost to ensure that the regional and spiritual status of the Sultan should remain intact. Sub has Chandra Bose, a renowned Indian leader, declares that around the middle of the 1920s, anti-British feeling was much stouter among the Muslims than among the rest of Indian population. (Bose, 1964)

A Khilafat movement was then initiated in India by the Ali Brothers and Abul Kalam Azad, and two delegations, one of which was being led by Maulana Muhammad Ali and the other being led by the Agha Khan, decided to plead, on behalf of the Sultan to British Prime Minister, George Lloyd. (Burke & Quraishi, 1995) Then later on, in 1924, the Turks themselves abolished the institution of Khalifat. The abolition of the Khilafat by Turks themselves caused great grief among subcontinent Muslims. Consequently, a watershed in the evolution of Muslim politics in India occurred as Muslim hopes turned inwards because they considered the priory focal point as a lost hope. The deep distress with which the Indian Muslims had regarded the decline of the Ottoman Empire and the demise of the Khilafat was later transformed into admiration for the way the new Republic of Turkey emerged as a vigorous, modern state from the ashes of the Sultanate. (Burke & Ziring, 1990)

Mohammad Ali Jinnah, the founding father and the first Governor General of Pakistan, showed an enormous appreciation for Ataturk—the founder of modern Turkey. On the occasion of the presentation of credentials by the first Turkish Ambassador to Pakistan on March 4, 1948, Jinnah said, ‘the exploits of your leaders in many a historic field of battle; the progress of your revolution; the rise and career of the great Ataturk, his revitalization of your nation by his great statesmanship, courage and foresight, are well known to the people of Pakistan.’ (On Spiritual and sentimental ties with Turkey, 1989)

**Pak-Turkey Relationship after 1947:**

The Turks have remembered the helping hand of Muslims of Indo-Pak and thus due to the gratifying memories of the support directed to them by the Muslims of British India, in the beginning of the twentieth century, they have been always helpful to Pakistan existence. The support by Turks was also stimulated with what the Turks considered as betrayal by the Arabs during the First World War. Turkey was thus profound to establish a close link with another large non-Arab Muslim country for which Pakistan was considered as a great deal. Thus Turk showed their compassion and interest in Pakistan following its independence in 1947. This compassion was mutually benefited and thus it fitted well with Pakistan’s policy of making good foreign relations especially with the Muslim world. (Amin, 2000)

So there is no doubt in saying that associations with Turkey were pleasant and affectionate long before the independence. The further friendly collaboration between the two countries resulted in the Baghdad Pact and later in the Regional Co-operation for Development (RCD), which then changed into the current Economic Cooperation Organization (ECO). Turkey and Pakistan strengthened their security relationship by signing the 1951 Treaty of Eternal Friendship. This treaty consequent to the increased assistance with NATO and the United States. As a proof of its loyalty with the West, Turkey sent armed forces to the Korean War. Beginning in 1952, NATO membership provided Turkey with an organized framework through which it could design its foreign policy around the Western alliance. Pakistan due to its part in signing this treaty began receiving American military aid in 1954. Another agreement on Turkey-Pakistan Friendship and Cooperation was signed in February 1954 in which Turkey emphasized that the treaty with Pakistan would serve as a way to increase peace and prosperity in the South Asian region and thus this emphasize ensured India that the signed agreement would not cause any harm to affiliation with them. Turkish Prime Minister Adnan Menderes also played a facilitation role in solving problems between Pakistan and Afghanistan. (ÇOLAKOĞLU, 2012) Additionally, a joint announcement was made that both states...
had mutually agreed to work closely on collaboration especially in the domain of politics, economics and culture while strengthening peace and safety for their respective interests and for the welfare of the region. The announcement was made simultaneously in Karachi and Ankara, on February 19, 1954. (Burke & Ziring, 1990)

The announcement of concentrating in the Turbo-Pakistan communiqué of February 1954 was given final shape in an agreement signed on April 2, 1964. Article IV dealt with co-operation in defense. It stated that the cooperation between the contracting parties in the field of the defense shall cover the following points:

(a) Exchange of information for the purpose of deriving benefit jointly from technical experience and progress;
(b) Endeavors to meet, as far as possible, the requirements of the Parties in the production of arms and ammunition;
(c) Studies and determination of the manners and extent of cooperation which might be effected between them in accordance with Article 51 of the Charter of the United Nations, should an unprovoked attack occur against them from outside. (Singh, 1970)

1955-1998 ERA- Baghdad Pact and RCD:

Turkey and Pakistan were also part of the Baghdad Pact that came into presence in 1955. The Baghdad Pact was a treaty provided for co-operation between members for their respective security and defense. It was specifically designed to counter the established Russian policy of expansion southwards in the direction of the Caspian and the Black Sea, and into Central Asia. Apart from Pakistan and Turkey, other members included in Baghdad Pact were Iraq, Iran, and Britain. The United States was not the official member and never signed the Pact but participated in its work. When in 1959, Iraq abandoned her membership from the Pact; the name of the organization was then changed to Central Treaty Organization (CENTO). CENTO undoubtedly functioned as a means to intensify the physical contacts, friendship, and mutual understanding between Pakistan, Turkey and Iran, which were already correlated with the terms of culture, shared religion, and geography. The countries sharing culture, religion and geography, put their resources to found a comparable organization under the name of Regional Cooperation for Development (RCD) in July 1964. It has been said that RCD was created because the members of CENTO considered that the associations of members with Western countries weren’t up to expectations. RCD was a by-product of the growing disappointment of Pakistan, Iran and Turkey with their ties with the Western countries. In the 1970s, Turkey and Pakistan provided both political and military support to one another. Ankara supported Pakistan diplomatically and militarily all the way through the process of Bangladesh attaining its independence, and did not recognize Bangladesh until Pakistan did. Regarding the Cyprus issue, Pakistan gave Turkey its full sustenance and provided it with military-logistical supplies. Then, both Pakistan and Turkey in 1979 observed the Iranian Revolution and the Soviet invasion of Afghanistan as hostile to their security interests.

Immediately after the invasion of West Pakistan in 1965, Pakistan invoked CENTO. Though Britain and the US denied responsibility under the Pact, Iran and Turkey, replied favorably to Pakistan’s plea for help. The Prime Minister of Turkey even issued a statement that India’s action in outspreading hostilities and conflicts outside the area of dispute in Kashmir itself had caused deep concern in Turkey, Pakistan’s ally in CENTO. (Burke & Ziring, 1990)

With the Iranian revolution and the consequent fall of the Shah of Iran in 1979, the RCD lost its enthusiasm as its secretariat was based in Tehran. Later efforts were made by Pakistani President, General Zia-ul-Haq in the mid-1980s to revive the RCD, but his efforts didn’t yield fruitful results.

Another factor that disadvantaged in the development of the RCD was the Afghan war of 1979-1989. With the collapse of the Soviet Union and the birth of Central Asian states, a new reality faced Turkey, Iran and Pakistan. Turkey’s pervasive interest in the Central Asian region was invigorated; the new Central Asian states looked up to Turkey because of close Turkish networks. Following these developments and the infighting of Taliban supported by Pakistan and the divisions of the Northern Alliance having the support of Turkey, relations between the two countries remained cold during that time period. After the recognition of the Taliban as the central government of Afghanistan by Pakistan, relations remained motionless. As a result, the traditional emotional warmth of bilateral relations somewhat enfeebled in attitude and content.

Musharraf’s ERA:

Then lately, two-sided relations received a significant boost after President Musharraf became Pakistan’s Head of State in October 1999 due to his thoughtful appreciation for Mustafa Kemal Ataturk, the founder of modern Turkey, whom he sees as a model statesman is on record. (Ilene R. Prusher, 2002)

A distinguishing feature of the mounting close mutual ties is the frequent exchanges of high-level visits. The President of Pakistan visited Turkey in November 1999. The visit was intended at briefing the Turkish leadership about the political changes in Pakistan and improvement of bilateral relations. Since then a number of high-level authoritative and official bilateral visits have taken place. It is important to note that harmony of views on various regional and international issues have prevailed in all of these meetings. Turkish President, President Necdet Sezer, visited Pakistan in October 2001; foreign minister, Abdullah Gul visited in May 2003; and Turkish Prime Minister, Tayyip Recep Erdogan visited Islamabad in June 2003. The fact that the Turkish Prime Minister’s associates included 110 businessmen showed Turkey’s desire to upsurge trade and economic cooperation with
Pakistan. Both sides signed three MoUs on road transport, drug trafficking and environment welfare. The visit of President Musharraf that took place on January 19-21, 2004, was seen as a very significant visit or as a milestone in cultivating bilateral relations in important sectors. President Musharraf made the first ever address to the Turkish parliament as a Pakistani leader. Several Memorandums of Understanding (MoUs) covering cooperation in battling international terrorism and organized crime as well as in the health and banking sectors were signed. Explicitly, according to the signed agreement on anti-terrorism, Ankara and Islamabad are to exchange experts and intelligence on terrorism and pursue a dual strategy, which evidently validates a new level of political alignment. (Zee Bureau Report, 2004) President Pervez Musharraf’s visit to Turkey pursued to revive relations that had gone somewhat cold during Pakistan’s support to extremist Taliban government in Afghanistan. Pakistan’s war on the side of the Taliban had brought the Northern Alliance under pressure. Turkey found itself affiliated with a large number of states repelling the Taliban order in Afghanistan. Although relations with Pakistan were defended from becoming visibly bitter, an undercurrent of offence was always to be felt. That period was considered optimistically over with the President’s visit and due to the signing of an anti-terrorism agreement it opened channels of information on who’s who in the international terror front. After a number of terrorist attacks in Pakistan and the suicide bombings suffered by Saudi Arabia and Turkey, the classification of ‘extremist Muslims’ has been accepted, who are the root cause for generating the misunderstanding that exists worldwide regarding Muslims.

The change in Turkey should be a part of a superior strategy of repairing and mending relations with Pakistan’s neighbors. A re-establishment of long-standing confidence in Ankara would have a affirmative consequence on the Northern Alliance in Afghanistan, wherein the Uzbeks form an important faction. According to the January 20, 2004 Agreement, Ankara and Islamabad would exchange ‘experts and intelligence’ on terrorism and pursue a combined strategy which reflects and reveals a new level of political alignment and a common purpose regarding the fight against terror. Both Pakistan and Turkey have been faced with terrorist acts in the past specifically for playing significant roles in the war against terrorism and both are determined for good relations with the West. There seems to be a growing commonality of interest and objectives between the two countries. Pakistan is a key partner in the movement against terrorism and has arrested over 500 terrorist suspects since September 11, 2001. The significant outbreak of terrorism faced by Turkey were the suicide bombings within a few days of each other, claimed by Jihadis, that killed 61 people in Istanbul in November 2003. (CNN, 2004) Pakistan seems profound to trace any imaginable links between radical Turkish Islamic groups and al-Qaeda. Turkey, in return, is dynamically investigating possible ties between the criminals of the November Istanbul bombings and Pakistan-based terrorist cells. The intelligence services of Turkey and Pakistan are also co-operating closely with US agencies. Pakistan and Turkey share insights on some of the most important current regional and international issues, as well as collaborate closely in multilateral fora including the UN, OIC, ECO and D-8. Both countries share similar sensitivities on international issues such as Iraq and Afghanistan. Both countries also extended useful support to each other from time to time on the Kashmir and Cyprus issues. Pakistan and Turkey have been important founding members of the OIC, the ECO and D-8, which projects them as natural leaders of the Muslim world. The lowest receding tide of bilateral relations was reached during the government of Turkish Prime Minister, Bulent Ecevit, when he visited India in April 2000 and deliberately praised its democracy and endorsed the Indian position on ‘cross-border terrorism’ and India’s draft UN agreement on international terrorism.

Turkey gathered leaders from the two countries together to overcome their differences regarding the strategy to fight the Taliban, which had grown increasingly effective in its tactics after 2005. As a result, in April 2007 Turkish President Ahmet Necdet Sezer, Afghan President Hamid Karzai, and Pakistani President Pervez Musharraf issued the Ankara Declaration, which was directed to escalate the assistance among the three countries. The declaration focused on strengthening bilateral relations, territorial integrity, and non-interference in one another’s domestic affairs. (BBC News, 2007)

By December 2008, when the second trilateral summit between Turkey, Pakistan, and Afghanistan was held, the presidents of Turkey and Pakistan had changed. After a short-term political crisis in Turkey, Abdullah Gül got ahead Ahmet Necdet Sezer in August 2007. Pakistan, on the other hand, experienced a more troubled political shift. Nationally and religiously driven violence ascended at a time of increasing opposition to Musharraf. Bending to pressure, Musharraf allowed Benazir Bhutto, who was abroad, to run in the February 2008 general elections. After Benazir Bhutto was assassinated during her electoral campaign in December 2007, the country slid into more instability. Then Asif Ali Zardari, Benazir Bhutto’s husband, replaced Musharraf, who finally had no choice but to resign on August 18, 2008. (Raza & Akbar, 2012) But fortunately even after such instability and unpredictable transformations, such changes in leadership positions did not affect the countries’ bilateral relations.

**PPPp’s ERA:**

On October 24, 2009, Ankara and Islamabad decided that Turkish Aerospace Industries would undertake the modernization of F-16 fighter jets belonging to Pakistan. In addition, Turkey agreed to help Pakistan improve relations with Central Asian nations. (They spoke of the Imam Hatip model Gilani’l, 2009) During Abdullah Gül’s visit to Islamabad in April 2010, it was agreed that Turkey would monitor the region more closely during its term
Pakistan and Turkey- The current situation:
While Pakistan and Turkey have always succeeding in maintaining friendly relations, the two nations and their governments are perhaps closer today than ever before. The close ties, friendly terms and heightened interactions are well worth the time for Pakistan and its authorities. Since 2000, Turkey's per capita income has increased from $4000 per year, to more than $11,000 per year. In this present time, the country has also fruitfully increased its foreign trade with a national security policy that welcomes imports that are used as inputs for its value-added exports provided all around the world. With per capita income of about $4800 per year (2013), Pakistan sits at the same level from where Turkey propelled its standard of living about 15 years ago. (BR Research, 2015)

Afterwards on October 31, 2015 - Islamabad—Ambassador Girgin of Turkey hosted a reception to celebrate 92nd Republic Day of his country. Turks holds a special national emotion for the respective occasion. They celebrate this day to maintain their freedom and to pay honors to the Founder of modern Turkey, Mustafa Kemal Ata Turk. A great number of guests including prominent people of the Federal Capital, diplomats, civil and military officials were invited. The Defense Minister, Khwaja Muhammad Asif and Governor Punjab Malik Muhammad Rafique Rajwana were the Guests of Honor.

The Turkish Ambassador started the ceremony with the kind words about ties with Pakistan in his welcome speech and talked about several aspects of close relationship with Pakistan. This speech was much appreciated by guests and analysts as Turkish Ambassador chose to speak in Urdu while adding spontaneous statements and explanations in English and Turkish. He also read out a special message sent by Turkish President Tayyip Erdogan in ceremony in which he threw light on the history of friendship between the two nations and talked about the ways to make it stronger. The Turkish President also expressed his deep grief in his message over the destruction and demises caused by the recent horrific earthquake that has hit Pakistan. He offered in all of his best capabilities to provide all possible assistance of his country to Pakistan for the relief of the affected people and for rehabilitation.(Ashraf Ansari, 2015)

Khwaja Muhammad Asif in reply to Ambassador’s warm tongue made a grateful speech highlighting the context and history of good terms between Pakistan and Turkey. He reflected that the relationship between the two nations is due to the shared consciousness of brotherhood, based on shared values and common national interest. He also showed his intentions to work on strengthening their mutual national interest by increasing trade opportunities for each other. He also welcomed the kindness of Turkish President and paid glowing tributes to the great Turk leader Mustafa Kemal Ata Turk who heroically led his countrymen to achieve victory against the enemies in the most challenging circumstances. (Ashraf Ansari, 2015)

Though there is no doubt that Pakistan and Turkey enjoys friendly terms politically, historically and culturally but one cannot deny the fact that there is still ground for trade and economic opportunities for both countries. Analysts believe that for the sake of better foreign relations, much is to be achieved in trade area both by the governments and private sector businessmen of the two countries. There is vast scope of much closer interdependence between the two countries in the economic fields. (Ashraf Ansari, 2015)

Being said that, Governor Mehtab Ahmad Khan also voiced his hope that relations between Pakistan and

......
Turkey can be advanced as both countries are willing to eradicate militancy. He voiced his thoughts in a ceremony held at a hotel in Peshawar on 12th of November 2015. The ceremony was been attended by a great number of government officials and prominent political figures including US Consul-General in Peshawar William Martin and Turkey’s Ambassador to Pakistan Sadiq Babur Girgin.

Speaking of the enduring good relations between the two states, Governor Mehtab said “Pakistan and Turkey are one body with two hearts.”

The governor also praised the nature of development and progress made in Turkey. He revealed his desire to the Turkish government to continue supporting Pakistan in its fight against militancy by appreciating the operations against terrorism. He said, “The operations have been largely successful and have brought the situation under control. Peace is returning to the region and things are now better. These achievements were made possible through the unforgettable sacrifices rendered by tribe’s people.”

Speaking on the occasion, Girgin thanked the governor for his kind words and vowed to continue supporting Pakistan through thick and thin. “Pakistan and Turkey have strong ties,” he said. “Recently, relations were further cemented between both countries with the ratification of several trade and development accords.” (ET Correspondent, 2015)

References


